INTERNATIONAL LEGAL AID GROUP CONFERENCE: 1 TO 3 APRIL 2009 – WELLINGTON, NEW ZEALAND

NATIONAL REPORT: HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGION OF THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA

1. The administration of legal aid

- 1.1 Legal aid services in Hong Kong, both civil and criminal, are administered by the Legal Aid Department (LAD) and overseen by the Legal Aid Services Council (LASC).
- 1.2 The LAD which is a government department and staffed by civil servants was set up in 1970. It has about 530 staff, 69 are lawyers including the Director of Legal Aid (DLA).
- 1.3. The LAD is organized into three divisions: Application and Processing Division, Litigation Division and Policy and Administration Division.
- 1.4 The Application and Processing Division receives and determines applications for civil legal aid. When legal aid is granted, the case is assigned to lawyers in private practice or to in-house lawyers in the Litigation Division if the case is one concerning personal injury including employees compensation claim or divorce and ancillary matter.
- 1.5 The Litigation Division comprises a Civil Litigation and a Crime Section. The Civil Litigation Section handles personal injuries and divorce cases. It also deals with the processing and the resulting litigation of wages claims from workers of insolvent employers. The Crime Section receives and determines applications for criminal legal aid. When legal aid is granted, the case is either assigned to lawyers in private practice or to in-house lawyers in the Crime Section.
- 1.6 The Policy and Administration Division supports the operation of LAD and consists of sections such as Accounts and Supplies, Policy and Development, Internal Audit, Information Technology Management and Training.
- 1.7. The LASC which is an independent statutory body, was established in 1996 to provide greater direct public participation in legal aid administration and policy formulation. Its membership consists of a Chairman not being a public officer or a lawyer, eight members and the DLA. Of the eight members, two must be barristers and two solicitors. The Chief Executive appoints the Chairman and the other members of the LASC except_the DLA who is an *ex officio* member. The LASC's operation is funded by the government.

1.8 The LASC serves as the Chief Executive's advisory body on the policy of the government concerning publicly funded legal aid services on areas such as eligibility criteria, scope of service, funding requirements. The LASC is also empowered to review the work of the LAD from time to time and as such the LAD is accountable to the LASC for the provision of its services. However legislation constituting the Legal Aid Services Council Ordinance (Cap. 489, Laws of Hong Kong) makes it clear that the LASC does not have power to direct LAD on staff matters or the handling of individual cases.

2. The different legal aid schemes in Hong Kong

- 2.1 Legal representation in both civil and criminal cases are available in Hong Kong to any person who has reasonable grounds for pursuing or defending a legal action but who would otherwise be prevented from doing so by lack of means.
- 2.2 Legal aid for civil proceedings is available under two schemes pursuant to the Legal Aid Ordinance, Cap. 91, Laws of Hong Kong. The Ordinary Legal Aid Scheme (OLAS) is available to any person whose financial resources do not exceed HK \$165,700.00 [i.e. US\$21,244.00].
- 2.3 The Supplementary Legal Aid Scheme (SLAS) is available to any person whose financial resources are in excess of the amount prescribed for OLAS but do not exceed HK\$460,300.00 [i.e. US\$59,013.00]. The scheme is self-financing and funded by contributions paid by aided persons and a percentage deduction from damages recovered on their behalf.
- 2.4 To qualify for legal aid, applicants must pass a means and merits test. The means test evaluates whether an applicant's financial resources exceed the financial eligibility limit prescribed for OLAS or SLAS. The merits test evaluates whether the applicant has reasonable grounds for bringing or defending civil proceedings and a reasonable prospect of success or of deriving some tangible benefit from being provided with legal representation at public expense.
- 2.5 Legal aid is available for all types of criminal cases at District Court level and above, for committal proceedings in the Magistrates' Courts, for appeals against decisions of magistrates and for appeals to the Court of Final Appeal. In order to qualify for legal aid in criminal cases, an applicant's financial resources cannot exceed the financial eligibility limit allowed under OLAS. An applicant who passes the means test will be granted legal aid for committals and trials. Legal aid is only available for appeals where there are meritorious grounds.

3. Legal aid funding

- 3.1 Legal aid services in Hong Kong are primarily financed by public funds. Funding for civil and criminal legal aid under the Ordinary Legal Aid Scheme comes from appropriations in the Government budget .
- 3.2 For the Supplementary Legal Aid Scheme which is a self-financing scheme, funding comes from application fees, contributions paid by successful applicants and percentage deduction from damages recovered for the aided persons.
- 3.3 A significant feature of legal aid funding in Hong Kong is that it is non-cash limited. In other words, there is no pre-determined funding cap and supplementary funding can be sought in the event expenses exceed the original estimate. Subject to the monitoring and approval of the LAD on the ground of reasonableness, there is no limit on the expenditure for any particular legally aided case which may involve solicitors, barristers and both local and overseas experts. Funding for the LASC is however cash limited.

4. Eligibility limits for legal aid

- 4.1 The financial eligibility limits for the two civil legal aid schemes and the criminal legal aid scheme have been referred to above. In Hong Kong the financial eligibility limits are reviewed annually to take account of changes in the Consumer Price Index and on a biennial basis to take into account of changes in private litigation costs. There is also a five-yearly review of the criteria for assessing financial eligibility of legal aid applicants.
- 4.2 The DLA has the discretion to waive the upper limit of financial resources in civil cases which involve a breach of the Hong Kong Bill of Rights Ordinance (Cap.383, Laws of Hong Kong), or where an inconsistency with the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights as applied to Hong Kong is an issue. For Criminal cases, the DLA has the discretion to grant legal aid even if the applicant's financial resources exceed the financial eligibility limit if he is satisfied that it is desirable in the interests of justice to do so, subject to payment of a contribution.
- 4.3 Applicants who are refused legal aid for civil matters may appeal to the Registrar of the High Court or in Court of Final Appeal cases, to a Review Committee chaired by the Registrar of the High Court and whose decision is final. Applicants who are refused legal aid in criminal cases may apply to a judge for legal aid to be granted to him, provided that he passes the means test. Applicants charged with or convicted of murder, treason or piracy with violence, may apply to a judge not only for legal aid for the trial and appeal, but also for exemption from the means test or payment of a contribution. Appeals against refusal of legal aid for appeals to the Court of Final Appeal are heard, as in civil cases, by a Review Committee.

4.4 It is estimated that at present about 55% of households in Hong Kong are eligible for legal aid under OLAS and that just above 70% of households are eligible for legal aid under OLAS and SLAS together.

5. Scope of the legal aid schemes in Hong Kong

- 5.1 Legal aid in Hong Kong consists of representation by lawyers of the LAD or legal aid panel lawyers and includes all assistance preliminary or incidental to any proceedings and such assistance as may be necessary to effect a compromise to bring an end to any proceedings.
- 5.2 OLAS covers civil proceedings in the District Court, the Court of First Instance and the Court of Appeal (both part of the High Court) and the Court of Final Appeal. It is also available for death inquests in the Coroner's Court where the interests of public justice require that legal aid be given and for proceedings in the Mental Health Review Tribunal.
- 5.3 Legal aid is not available for certain proceedings such as defamation (except defending a counter-claim alleging defamation), relator actions, Small Claims Tribunal matters, Labour Tribunal matters, partnership disputes, money claims in derivatives of securities, currency futures or futures contracts, election petitions except those involving a possible breach of the Hong Kong Bill of Rights Ordinance or an inconsistency with the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights as applied to Hong Kong.
- 5.4 SLAS covers cases involving personal injuries or death and medical, dental and legal professional negligence where the claim for damages exceeds or is likely to exceed HK\$60,000.00 [i.e. US\$7,692.00]. It also covers claims brought under the Employees' Compensation Ordinance irrespective of the amount.

6. Statistics

6.1 Statistics on the number of certificates granted under each legal aid scheme

	2007		2008	
		No. or legal aid applications		No. of legal aid applicati ons
Ordinary Legal Aid Scheme	7,858	15,462	7,418	15,168
Supplementary Legal Aid Scheme	79	136	95	146
Criminal Legal Aid Scheme	2,507	3,765	2,235	3,413

6.2 Distribution on the number of certificates issued for Civil Legal Aid

	No. of Certificates for Civil Legal Aid		
	2007	2008	
Personal Injuries Claims	2,100	2,245	
Matrimonial Cases	5,141	4,536	
Land and Tenancy Disputes	55	44	
Employment Disputes	22	21	
Immigration Matters	41	45	
Wages Claims	260	247	
Others*	318	375	
Total	7,937	7,513	

^{*} Others include miscellaneous cases involving judicial reviews, medical and professional negligence etc

6.3 Distribution on the number of certificates issued for Criminal Legal Aid

	No. of Certificates for Criminal Legal Aid		
	2007	2008	
Committal Proceedings	371	349	
District Court Trials	1,427	1,291	
Court of First Instance Trials	355	325	
Magistrate's Court Appeals	133	112	
District Court Appeals	135	87	
Court of First Instance Appeals	61	44	
Appeals in Court of Final Appeal	17	23	
Others*	8	4	
Total	2,507	2,235	

* Others include such miscellaneous matters as bail applications.

7. Legal aid expenditure

	OLAS	CRIME	SLAS	
	HK\$'000	HK\$'000	HK\$'000	
2007	327,711	96,691	4,804	
2008	346,375	83,257	21,618	

The above figures do not include the personal emoluments of LAD staff which is in the region of HK\$20M and LAD departmental expenses of about HK\$18M. Total legal aid budget for the financial year from 1st April 2007 to 31st March 2008 was HK\$504M. Hong Kong has a population of about 6.9M.

Note: the exchange rate being HK\$7.80 = US\$1.00

8. Lawyers and legal aid work

8.1 The LAD currently has 69 lawyers including the DLA most of whom are deployed in the Application and Processing Division. Legally aided representation is therefore mostly provided by lawyers in private practice who are on the legal aid panel. There are about 7,270 practicing lawyers in Hong Kong and nearly 40% of them are on the legal aid panel. Legal aid panel solicitors and barristers are assigned legal aid cases having regard to their level of experience and expertise and the type and complexity of the particular case.

Cases which are assigned out to panel lawyers are monitored by the LAD to ensure that the aided persons' interests are best served and public funds are employed in a cost effective manner.

9. More Information

More information on the Legal Aid Services Council and the Legal Aid Department of Hong Kong are available at:

www.info.gov.hk/lasc

www.lad.gov.hk